

Collaboration Rubric - Description

Collaboration is the 21st Century Skill for students where their apprenticeship performance task requires them to work successfully as a team. Any time the final task for an apprenticeship hinges on a team effort, this rubric will be a good fit for planning and assessment. Before using the collaboration rubric, familiarize yourself with each domain.

Working as a Member of a Team. Working in a team means asking questions to understand others’ perspectives in order to move the work forward. It means gracefully responding to criticism and praise, negotiating the views and beliefs of the individual group members, adjusting one’s own work to honor those negotiations, and it means assuming a shared responsibility for the work, for better or for worse. In order for students to work as a member of a team they will need to stretch their own comfort zones; students will have to be comfortable with changing priorities and ambiguity as the group figures out its shared identity.

Active Speaking and Listening. To collaborate effectively, students will show mutual respect by actively listen when others are speaking. Students will only interrupt each other politely and when it serves an immediate and relevant purpose. Students will share their own relevant ideas and respectfully engage in others’ reactions. Students will speak politely with each other, paying special care to use empathetic language, such as “I hear you saying,” “I feel that,” “I think we can all agree,” etc.

Standard	Criteria	Advanced	Mastery	Developing	Attempting
1. Citizen Schools students will demonstrate an ability to work as a member of a team.	1. Use language that shows understanding of other people's perspective.	You use language that shows an understanding of other people's perspective and questions from the group working on the task.	You use language that shows an understanding of other people's perspective.	You use language that shows an understanding of other people's perspective, but not all the time.	You use language that shows an understanding of other people's perspective, but not all the time.
	2. Deal positively with praise and criticism for and from peers.	You respond to praise and criticism graciously and respectfully change your behavior as a result.	You respond to praise and criticism graciously.	You respond to praise and criticism, but not all the time.	You respond to praise and criticism, but not all the time.
	3. Negotiate and balance different views and beliefs in team conversations.	You regularly take the lead in efforts to reach compromise when different views and beliefs are in play.	You regularly participate in all efforts to reach compromise when different views and beliefs are in play.	You regularly participate in all efforts to reach compromise when different views and beliefs are in play.	You regularly participate in all efforts to reach compromise when different views and beliefs are in play.
	4. Assume work to be shared collaboration in real time.	You regularly adjust your work to meet agreed upon compromises and make adjustments often to make it stay on track as the team.	You regularly adjust your work to meet agreed upon compromises.	You regularly adjust your work to meet agreed upon compromises.	You regularly adjust your work to meet agreed upon compromises.
5. Assume shared responsibility for collaborative work.	You discuss the group work as if it were your own and your own work as if it were the group and your share responsibility when necessary.	You discuss the group work as if it were your own, and your own work as if it were the group.	You discuss the group work as if it were your own, and your own work as if it were the group.	You discuss the group work as if it were your own, and your own work as if it were the group.	

Collaboration Rubric – Scoring

Scale & Rating

21st Century Skill Rubrics are based on a 5-point scale, and we label each with a performance level from Advanced to Non-Performance.

Levels of Performance OR General Rating Rules

- **Advanced (4):** Advanced is a rating that goes beyond the desired result. When a student shows exceptional insight, innovation, or detail related to the task they might be rated Advanced. A small percentage of students will achieve this rating. If lots of students are being rated as Advanced, you may want to check the difficulty of the task or the rigor of your evaluation.
- **Mastery (3):** This is our desired level of performance for all students. It should match the domain descriptor on the far left of each row.
- **Developing (2):** An effort that is approaching Mastery but not quite there would be Developing. If student performance is close enough to Mastery that, with only a little help, it could get there the student is probably Developing.
- **Attempting (1):** if the student makes an effort but it’s nowhere close to what you asked for, it’s **Attempting**
- **Non-performance (0):** If the student doesn’t make any attempt, it’s Non-Performance. Non-performance is not included on the rubric because it is the absence of any effort and should be scored as 0.

Determining Mastery

Certain rows and phrases in the rubric have been bolded to highlight what specifically sets each rating (Advanced, Developing, or Attempting) apart from Mastery. Consider this row:

e. Treat others with dignity and respect	You consistently listen and react to others equally regardless of personal feelings or past incidents; you regularly seek to understand and bridge differences between members of the group.	You consistently listen and react to others positively regardless of personal feelings or past incidents.	You listen and react to others respectfully but frustration or bias for other members of your group sometimes shows through.	Your words and actions make it clear that you have preferences among the people in your group.
--	---	---	---	---

Those words and phrases in bold are what sets one description apart from another. The Mastery descriptor states, “You consistently listen and react to others positively regardless of personal feelings or past incidents.” While there is a huge range of behaviors we could include in a row about treating others with dignity and respect, we have chosen positivity and objectivity. Below is how we break it down by each level of mastery:

- **Advanced:** If the student is able to listen and consider each teammate equally and move others in the groups to do the same, especially when differences arise, then this student is in advance of the expected performance on this row.
- **Mastery:** If the student is able to listen to and consider each teammate equally, they have mastered this row.
- **Developing:** If frustration or bias sometimes creeps into the student’s words and actions, this skill is still developing in the student.
- **Attempting:** If the student is trying to be impartial but clearly favors certain teammates over others, the student is making an unsuccessful attempt.
- **Non-performance:** If the student doesn’t make any observable attempts to treat other people with dignity and respect, or is actively disrespectful to others, this is non-performance.

Scoring FAQs

1. How should I modify scoring expectations for students with special needs?
 - In general you should NOT modify scoring expectations for students with special needs. Instead the task itself should be modified to accommodate any student-specific needs. These modifications will naturally vary from student to student, but examples could include increasing the amount of time allowed to complete the task, providing extra inter-personal counseling to the student, or providing more advanced warning when group dynamics may be stressed.
2. When do I assess students on each row?
 - Unlike other 21st Century Skills, Collaboration does not rely on a product for an evaluation. Instead, if you are teaching and assessing students with this rubric you need to plan out how you will do so on a rolling basis. There are two approaches to this:

-
1. Tracking tool: Create a tracking tool and keep notes on as many group interactions as you can over the course of the apprenticeship, determining a final rating at the end. There is a sample tool at the end of this document, with a sample student record completed.
 2. Discreet skill instruction/assessment: A different tact may be to plan the apprenticeship so that each part of the skill is taught discretely, and thus assessed discretely. This compartmentalizes the work and allows you to focus on lesson-specific content. If you choose this route, it would be wise to allow changes in your evaluations as informal observations dictate. For example, if you find a student has mastered Row 2.b (the interruption row) early in the apprenticeship but then you notice her interrupting more without good reasons later on, you can assess her again. Just be sure to let her know you're reassessing her so she has the opportunity to adjust back to her mastery performance.
 3. How do I score row 1e, the one about credit and blame?
 - Row 1e measures the degree to which the student is taking responsibility for the work of the whole group. Our purpose here is to teach students that being part of a team means making oneself responsible for the quality of all work put out by the team. An Advanced student will talk about group work as if it were her own. They may refer to the work as "ours," but there is never a hint of other people being responsible for discrete aspects of the work. A student who is rated Mastery – the desired performance level – may let on that specific people played specific roles, but will always talk about wins as 'team wins' and losses as 'team losses.' The difference between Attempting and Developing is a bit tougher to discern. In both cases, the student is either taking blame or credit, but not both. However, it is better (Developing) if the student shares blame with her teammates but demurs from taking credit than if she is willing to take credit but puts the blame for mistakes solely on others (Attempting). Of course, if the student never addresses credit or blame, that would be Non-performance (0).

Standard	Criteria	Advanced	Mastery	Developing	Attempting
<p>1. Citizen Schools students will demonstrate an ability to work as a member of a team</p>	<p>a. Use questions that deepen understanding of other people's perspective</p>	<p>You ask clarifying questions to ensure understanding of others' positions; your questions keep the group working on the task.</p>	<p>You ask clarifying questions to ensure understanding of others' positions.</p>	<p>You ask clarifying questions to ensure understanding of others' positions; your questions use challenge language.</p>	<p>The questions you ask do not attempt to clarify other's positions (i.e. questions challenge partners who disagree with the asker's position).</p>
	<p>b. Respond positively with praise and criticism for and from peers</p>	<p>You respond to praise and criticism gracefully and noticeably change your behavior as a result.</p>	<p>You respond to praise and criticism gracefully (you are polite, positive, and action oriented).</p>	<p>You respond to praise gracefully, but not criticism.</p>	<p>You respond to praise and criticism without grace.</p>
	<p>c. Negotiate and balance diverse views and beliefs to reach workable solutions</p>	<p>You regularly take the lead in efforts to reach compromise when diverse views and beliefs are in play.</p>	<p>You regularly participate fully in all efforts to reach compromise when diverse views and beliefs are in play.</p>	<p>You regularly participate timidly or reluctantly in all efforts to reach compromise when diverse views and beliefs are in play</p>	<p>You regularly participate aggressively to stand your ground when diverse views and beliefs are in play</p>
	<p>d. Adjusts work to facilitate collaboration in real-time</p>	<p>You willingly adjust your own work to meet agreed upon compromises and make observable efforts to make it easy for others to do the same.</p>	<p>You willingly adjust your own work to meet agreed upon compromises.</p>	<p>You reluctantly adjust your own work to meet agreed upon compromises.</p>	<p>You do your own work without honoring the agreed upon compromises.</p>
	<p>e. Assume shared responsibility for collaborative work</p>	<p>You discuss the group work as if it were your own, and your own work as if it came from the group and your share credit/blame where necessary.</p>	<p>You share credit for group work when things go well and share blame when they do not.</p>	<p>You share blame with the group when things go bad, but not credit when they go well.</p>	<p>You share credit with the group when things go well, but not blame when they do not.</p>

	f. Works effectively in a climate of ambiguity and changing priorities	You consistently remain calm and focused when things do not go as planned often shepherding the group through rough times.	You consistently remain calm and focused when things do not go as planned (e.g. when plans change, as the needs of the group shift etc.)	You can return to calm and focused work after a significant adjustment period during which you may not be contributing as you normally would.	You do not adapt well to change; it is difficult for you to remain productive as circumstances, priorities, or plans change.
2. Citizen Schools students will share speaking time and engage in active listening	a. Demonstrate engaged body language.	When someone else is talking, you make eye contact and face speaker and show positivity and enthusiasm for what others have to say (e.g. smiling, thanking them for sharing, etc.)	When someone else is talking, you make eye contact and face speaker.	When someone else is talking, you make eye contact or face the speaker.	When someone else is talking you strike a hostile/closed body position (e.g. looks down, arms folded, frowns, etc.)
	b. Comprehends when it is appropriate to listen	You never interrupt others without purpose and manners and can interject politely to add to or maintain the momentum of a conversation.	You never interrupt others without purpose and manners.	You sometimes interrupt others without purpose and manners.	You often interrupt others without purpose and manners.
	c. Comprehends when it is appropriate to speak	You speak when you have something relevant to say and what you say consistently adds to the productivity of the group.	You speak when you have something relevant to say.	You sometimes do not speak when you have something relevant to say.	You speak even when you do not have something relevant to say , often making it difficult for others to participate.

	<p>d. Uses empathetic language while communicating with group members</p>	<p>You show empathy by rephrasing what others say in a way that acknowledges their feelings and share your feelings using "I statements" (e.g. "I feel that...")</p>	<p>You show empathy by rephrasing what others say in a way that acknowledges their feelings (e.g. "I hear you are feeling..." or "What I hear you saying is..." etc.)</p>	<p>You repeat what others say to demonstrate understanding.</p>	<p>You use negative or blaming language such as "You're wrong," or "That's a bad idea."</p>
	<p>e. Treat others with dignity and respect</p>	<p>You consistently listen and react to others equally regardless of personal feelings or past incidents; you regularly seek to understand and bridge differences between members of the group.</p>	<p>You consistently listen and react to others positively regardless of personal feelings or past incidents.</p>	<p>You listen and react to others respectfully but frustration or bias for other members of your group sometimes shows through.</p>	<p>Your words and actions make it clear that you have preferences among the people in your group.</p>

